Theories of value and lessons for evaluating collaborative activities of information services

Christine Urquhart
Introduction

Value and impact studies of library and information services

Mostly examine how the service has affected the individual user

How realistic is this in the network age, when library and information services are collaborating with other agencies to serve clients better?

What theories of value exist to help?
Aims and objectives of presentation are to:

Outline the approach (meta-study of theoretical approaches, meta-synthesis of some research studies)

Discuss application to LIS

Reflect on possible future directions for value work in library and information services
Approach

Systematic review

Literature search

Meta-study of the theoretical approaches to determine (perceived) value, and value creation

Meta-synthesis of research studies using these approaches, with emphasis on teamwork, collaborative activity – and applicable to library and information services
Literature searching

Much of this literature is in the marketing literature with a small offshoot in the management/requirements engineering (value modelling)

Web of Knowledge, plus LISA/LISTA (about 1000 records) 1990-2011
Theories of value......and associated research designs
Library and information service value and impact studies
(Used existing reviews as anchors)
Mapping the literature

Value (mainly perceived value, value creation, value constellation)

Value creation and requirements engineering

Library and information services
health sector value and impact (clinical decision making, patient decision making)
Value concepts relevant to collaborative activities:

Perceived value

Value creation/value constellation

(Value based requirements engineering)
Perceived value

Theoretical overview (Sánchez-Fernández & Iniesta-Bonillo, 2007) of key ideas:

Utility versus disutility (usefulness versus price paid)

Value and quality – linked but distinct

Measured – as a uni-dimensional construct or as a multi-dimensional construct
Unidimensional construct

Measured by one item (or set of items)
Price
Product attributes, perceived consequences of consumption, personal values of consumers (means-end)
(trade-off between giving and getting)

Example: Student searching
Google (cheap in time...will get something)
Cochrane Library (more complex...important to find good quality evidence)
Multi-dimensional construct (perceived value)

Customer value hierarchy (customer value changes over time)
Utilitarian/hedonic value (emotional value included)
Value theory (extrinsic, intrinsic, systemic – relationship between sacrifices and returns)
Consumption values theory (functional, social, emotional, epistemic, conditional)
Holbrook’s typology (self-oriented vs other-oriented, active vs reactive, extrinsic vs. Intrinsic)
Measurement of perceived value

Generally quantitative (regression, factor analysis etc.

Some (limited) verification of models

Review suggests Holbrook’s typology the most comprehensive (but complex)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Extrinsic (embedded or clinical librarian)</th>
<th>Intrinsic (embedded or clinical librarian)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-oriented</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active</td>
<td><em>Efficiency</em> – time savings</td>
<td><em>Play</em> – learning about searching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reactive</td>
<td><em>Excellence</em> – finding good evidence</td>
<td><em>Aesthetics</em> – search report format</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other-oriented</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active</td>
<td><em>Status</em> – effective presentation (journal club)</td>
<td><em>Ethics</em> – quality of patient/client care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reactive</td>
<td><em>Esteem</em> – reputation of journal club</td>
<td><em>Spirituality</em> – professional ethics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Value creation

Value co-creation (consumer active in the process – bar code DIY readers in supermarket)

Value constellation
  Allows for networks of suppliers/providers to work together – more realistic now than the value chain

Modelling via value requirements engineering
Some theorists....

Prahalad & Ramaswamy (value co-creation)

Varga & Losch (service dominant logic)

Normann & Ramirez (value constellation)
Normann (reframing business, liquification, density)

All stress that the consumer (and/or suppliers) are involved in value creation
Normann (& Ramirez, 1993) and Varga & Losch (2004 and later) – related ideas

Value constellation: Not a value chain – allows for the collaboration/networking of suppliers, co-creation with consumer.

Varga & Losch – service-dominant logic – goods are not the focus, service and processes are. Reciprocal service-for-service orientation

Normann (2001) - reframing business – concepts of liquification and density
Example:

**Value constellation** (users, librarians, members of other business organisations) – Ikeya et al. (2011)

Focus: business information services in Japan

Researchers found that the model - reference service or consultation specialist service affected the value to be expected.

Moral: look carefully at the way the value constellation is organised
Example:

**Service dominant logic**

Applied to the National Cancer Information Service evaluations – the value needs to consider interactions between patient and carers, patient and professional – as well as patient and information service.

Applied to “information prescriptions”, or bibliotherapy services “books on prescription” – the network involved in supporting the service.
Example:

**Liquification**
- Essentially about digitisation of information – easier to move around, mash up.

- Consequences – can reassign activities previously kept separate – library users submitting book reviews online – a new service for other library users

**New densities** – and denser patterns of co-production of services
Conclusions

Literature searching for this type of work a challenge!
And meta-synthesis!!!!!

Marketing – many theories – much of the literature to test and refine theories are quantitative

Main lesson – there are marketing theories around value co-creation, value constellation – which could be applied.
Requires reframing of library impact studies - not what WE did ALONE, to what WE did TOGETHER with....
References (selected)
Prahalad CK, Ramaswamy V. Co-creation experiences: the next practice in value creation. Journal of Interactive Marketing 2004; 18:5-14